PUCO Apples to Apples Natural Gas Rate Comparison Chart

Columbia Gas of Ohio

Publication Date: March 10, 2009

The PUCO produces the *Apples to Apples* charts to provide consumers with a snapshot comparison of current natural gas supplier price options and contract terms for individual customers. You may also want to check with your local government to see if your community has grouped together citizens into a buying pool to purchase gas. The PUCO updates the charts on a weekly basis and verifies each supplier offer to ensure accuracy. As with all contracts, consumers should carefully read and understand all terms and conditions before signing any forms or agreeing to enroll with a supplier for natural gas service. For a description of *Apples to Apples* chart-related terms, please refer to ***Chart Definitions*** that follows the ***Supplier Plans, Rates, Terms and Conditions*** section.

The PUCO provides the tools you need to calculate your estimated cost. The ***Self-Calculation Worksheet*** that follows ***Chart Definitions*** walks you through the steps needed to manually calculate your own estimated cost. You can also visit ***www.puco.ohio.gov*** and click on the ***Apples to Apples*** link to access the ***Apples to Apples Interactive Calculator*** and automatically calculate your estimated costs.

Columbia Gas of Ohio's Rate

Columbia Gas of Ohio's (CGO) current total rate is **$1.16972** per hundred cubic feet (Ccf) effective from **March 03, 2009** to **March 30, 2009**. This includes a Gas Cost Recovery (GCR) rate of **$0.94689** per Ccf, a gross receipts tax of **$0.04722** per Ccf on the GCR and transportation costs of **$0.17561** per Ccf (gross receipts tax included). CGO's GCR rate varies each month and provides a dollar-for-dollar recovery of costs incurred by the local utility to purchase natural gas. The GCR rate allows the local utility to correct any over or under collections of natural gas costs from previous periods if the actual cost is different than the estimate.

Contact information for Columbia Gas of Ohio: 200 Civic Center Dr., Columbus, OH 43215, (800) 344-4077, www.ColumbiagasofOhio.com.

PUCO-Certified Retail Natural Gas Suppliers Actively Soliciting New Customers

Supplier Name	Web Page Address	Telephone
Commerce Energy of Ohio, Inc.	***http://www.commerceenergy.com***	***(877) 226-5371***
Direct Energy Services, LLC	***http://www.directenergy.com***	***(888) 566-9988***
Dominion East Ohio Energy	***http://www.dom.com/about/companies/retail/choice_eoe.jsp***	***(800) 990-4090***
Energy Cooperative of Ohio	***http://www.ohioenergycoop.org***	***(877) 439-3706***
IGS Energy	***http://www.igsenergy.com***	***(877) 444-7427***
Integrys Energy Services, Inc.	***http://www.integrysenergy.com***	***(866) 336-5547***
MxEnergy, Inc.	***http://www.mxenergy.com***	***(888) 898-4323***
Vectren Source	***http://www.vectrensource.com***	***(800) 516-6740***
Volunteer Energy Services, Inc.	***http://www.volunteerenergy.com***	***(800) 977-8374***

Supplier Plans, Rates, Terms and Descriptions

Listed below are the natural gas plan offers of PUCO-certified suppliers, per Ccf. Published offers are subject to change without prior notice. The ***Supplier Total Rate,*** which is the price to compare, includes the ***Supplier Base Rate*** and CGO's current transportation charge. If comparing Supplier Total Rate to CGO's total GCR rate, which is currently set at ***$1.16972/Ccf,*** keep in mind that the Supplier Base Rate is exclusive of applicable state and county sales tax, whereas CGO's total GCR rate is tax inclusive. As CGO's transportation rate historically changes quarterly, the Supplier Total Rate is subject to change post publication; therefore, this information should be used only as a guide. Consumers should verify offers with the supplier before signing a contract. ***The PUCO is not responsible for selections you make based on the information contained herein.***

Fixed Rate Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Commerce Energy of Ohio, Inc.	5244	$0.93000	$1.10561	24-Month		$50.00
	5243	$0.89900	$1.07461	12-Month		$25.00
Dominion East Ohio Energy	5235	$0.89500	$1.07061	Through 2/2010 Billing Cycle		$50.00
Direct Energy Services, LLC	5207	$0.89900	$1.07461	12-Month		$0.00
IGS Energy	5220	$0.89000	$1.06561	Through 12/2009 Billing Cycle		$0.00
	5219	$0.89000	$1.06561	Through 6/2010 Billing Cycle		$100.00
MxEnergy, Inc.	5237	$0.99900	$1.17461	12-Month		$150.00
Vectren Source	5227	$0.95000	$1.12561	12-Month		$125.00

Monthly Variable Rate Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Commerce Energy of Ohio, Inc.	5245	$0.93490	$1.11051	Monthly		$0.00
Energy Cooperative of Ohio	5249	$0.86000	$1.03561	Monthly		$0.00
Integrys Energy Services, Inc.	5211	$0.91600	$1.09161	12-Month	EcoVations Renewable Gas w/ Carbon Offsets AT NO EXTRA	$0.00
MxEnergy, Inc.	5238	$0.94900	$1.12461	Monthly		$0.00
Vectren Source	5228	$0.91500	$1.09061	Monthly		$0.00
Volunteer Energy Services, Inc.	5252	$0.86200	$1.03761	Monthly		$0.00

Quarterly Variable Rate Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Integrys Energy Services, Inc.	5210	$1.06500	$1.24061	12-Month	EcoVations Renewable Gas w/ Carbon Offsets AT NO EXTRA	$0.00

Variable Rate Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
IGS Energy	5221	$0.91680	$1.09241	Through 8/2009 Billing Cycle	Guaranteed Savings off Columbia's GCR!	$0.00

Variable Rate w/Fixed Winter/Variable Summer Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Integrys Energy Services, Inc.	5212	$1.15200	$1.32761	12-Month	EcoVations Renewable Gas w/ Carbon Offsets AT NO EXTRA	$0.00

Chart Definitions

Ccf: One hundred cubic feet; a unit used to measure natural gas usage.

Contract Term: The length or duration of the contract (i.e. monthly, yearly, multiple-year).

County Sales Tax: When natural gas is purchased from a supplier, the natural gas is subject to Ohio sales or use tax. Because county sales tax rates vary throughout Ohio, the county sales tax is not included in the supplier's total rate. Use the attached map to determine your county's sales tax rate.

Current Offer: Comprised of suppliers' current commodity options and base rates, exclusive of sales tax, the local utility transportation charge, and customer service charges. Commodity options may be a fixed, variable, or stable rate plan.

Expected Gas Cost (EGC): A component of the GCR, the EGC is the price the local utility expects to pay for natural gas in the upcoming GCR rate period. For example, if the GCR rate is filed on a monthly basis, the local utility will calculate the EGC for the following month. Gas costs recoverable through the EGC include the cost of purchasing the gas itself as well as the cost of transporting the gas from the producing region to the local utility's service territory through the interstate pipeline system.

Fixed Rate Plan: A constant rate for the contracted period.

Gas Cost Recovery (GCR) Rate: A mechanism that provides a dollar-for-dollar recovery of costs incurred by a natural gas utility to purchase natural gas to its system. The GCR mechanism enables the local utility to correct any over or under collections of natural gas costs in previous periods.

Gross Receipts Tax: When natural gas is purchased from a local utility, it is not subject to Ohio sales or use tax. The local utility must pay a gross receipts excise tax which is applied to the combined Monthly Customer and Riser Surcharge Charges and on the GCR and Transportation rates charged on the volume of gas consumed (per Ccf).

Stable Rate Plan: A variable rate for a fixed period of time.

Supplier Name: PUCO-certified suppliers that are actively enrolling new customers.

Supplier Total Rate: Comprised of the supplier's natural gas commodity prices, plus the LDC transportation rate charge.

Transportation Rate Charge: The transportation rate charge, which can fluctuate quarterly, is comprised of a base rate, Percentage of Income Payment Plan rider, excise tax rider, uncollectible expense rider, Choice program sharing credit and a gross receipts tax.

Variable Rate Plan: A fluctuating rate within the contracted period.

Questions to ask Suppliers

- Are there any deposit requirements?
- Do you charge any early termination fees? If so, how much?
- Do you charge any switching, membership, or other fees?
- Are you certified by the PUCO?
- Is your rate fixed, or does it change?
- If it is a variable rate, how does it change?
- Is there a customer incentive for signing up?
- Are there any built-in price increases or decreases?
- Are there any special add-on services?
- How long is the contract for this offer?
- Does your service cover all months of the year?
- What happens when my contract expires?
- Will I receive one or two bills a month?

Self-Calculation Worksheet

This self-calculation worksheet will provide you with an estimate of your monthly natural gas costs, based on your average monthly gas usage, current supplier price, transportation and service charges, and local sales tax. You may also wish to visit ***www.PUCO.ohio.gov*** to access our interactive *Apples to Apples* calculator to automatically calculate your estimated monthly natural gas costs.

	Example	Your Calculation
Step 1: Supplier Offer Insert the supplier's current offer.	**Supplier Offer: $0.91972/Ccf**	**Supplier Offer: $_____/Ccf**
Step 2: Figure your Average Monthly Usage Divide your annual gas usage in Ccf *(provided on your monthly bill)* by 12.	(annual gas usage) **804 Ccf** ÷ 12 **Average Monthly Usage: 67 Ccf**	(annual gas usage) _____/Ccf ÷ 12 **Average Monthly Usage:** _____Ccf
Step 3: Supplier Charge Multiply the supplier offer by your monthly gas usage.	(supplier offer) **$0.91972** (average monthly usage) x 67 **Supplier Charge: $ 61.62**	(supplier offer) $ _____ (average monthly usage) x_____ **Supplier Charge:** $ _____
Step 4: Tax on Supplier Charge Multiply the supplier charge by your ***county sales tax rate*** that can be ascertained online through the Ohio Department of Taxation.	(supplier charge) **$ 61.62** (county sales tax rate) x 0.07 **Tax on Supplier Charge: $ 4.31**	(supplier charge) $ _____ (county sales tax rate) x 0._____ **Tax on Supplier Charge:** $ _____
Step 5: Transportation (Delivery) Charge Multiply the delivery rate by your average monthly usage *(includes gross receipts tax)*.	(delivery rate) **$0.17561** (average monthly usage) x 67 **Delivery Charge: $ 11.77**	(delivery rate) **$0.17561** (average monthly usage) x_____ **Delivery Charge: $**_____
Step 6: Supplier Estimated Monthly Cost Add the supplier charge, the tax on supplier charge, the delivery charge, and a monthly customer charge of $13.08 *(includes riser surcharge and gross receipts tax)*.	(supplier charge) **$ 61.62** (sales tax on supplier charge) 4.31 (delivery charge) 11.77 (monthly customer charge) + 13.08 **Supplier Estimated Monthly Cost: $ 90.78**	(supplier charge) $_____ (sales tax on supplier charge) _____ (delivery charge) _____ (monthly customer charge) + 13.08 **Supplier Estimated Monthly Cost: $**_____
Step 7: Columbia Gas of Ohio (CGO) Estimated Monthly Cost Multiply CGO's current total rate *(includes gas and delivery charges, plus gross receipts tax)* by your average monthly usage, then add the monthly customer charge.	(CGO's current total rate) **$1.16972** (average monthly usage) x 67 (subtotal) 78.37 (monthly customer charge) + 13.08 **CGO Estimated Monthly Cost: $ 91.45**	(CGO's current total rate) **$1.16972** (average monthly usage) x_____ (subtotal) _____ (monthly customer charge) + 13.08 **CGO Estimated Monthly Cost: $**_____
Step 8: Compare Compare the supplier's estimated monthly cost to that of Columbia Gas of Ohio.	**Supplier: $90.78/month** **Columbia Gas of Ohio: $91.45/month**	**Supplier: $_____/month** **Columbia Gas of Ohio: $_____/month**