PUCO Apples to Apples Natural Gas Rate Comparison Chart
Columbia Gas of Ohio

Publication Date: November 15, 2011

The PUCO produces the *Apples to Apples* charts to provide consumers with a snapshot comparison of current natural gas supplier price options and contract terms for individual customers. You may also want to check with your local government to see if your community has grouped together citizens into a buying pool to purchase gas. The PUCO updates the charts on a weekly basis and verifies each supplier offer to ensure accuracy. As with all contracts, consumers should carefully read and understand all terms and conditions before signing any forms or agreeing to enroll with a supplier for natural gas service. For a description of *Apples to Apples* chart-related terms, please refer to ***Chart Definitions*** that follows the ***Supplier Plans, Rates, Terms and Conditions*** section.

The PUCO provides the tools you need to calculate your estimated cost. The ***Self-Calculation Worksheet*** that follows ***Chart Definitions*** walks you through the steps needed to manually calculate your own estimated cost. You can also visit ***www.puco.ohio.gov*** and click on the ***Apples to Apples*** link to access the ***Apples to Apples Interactive Calculator*** and automatically calculate your estimated costs.

Columbia Gas of Ohio's Rate

The Standard Service Offer (SSO) rate is based on the New York Mercantile Exchange month-end settlement price, plus a Retail Price Adjustment of $0.188 per ccf. The SSO is a monthly variable rate and represents cost associated with the securing gas for CGO customers.

Columbia Gas of Ohio's (CGO) current total rate is **$0.59196** per hundred cubic feet (ccf)

Effective from **October 27, 2011** to **November 28, 2011**

This total rate includes:

The Standard Service Offer (SS0) of	**$0.54040** per ccf
A Regulatory Assessment Rider rate of	**$0.00177** per ccf
A Gross Receipts Tax Amount of	**$0.02704** per ccf on the SSO
Transportation costs of	**$0.02275** per ccf (gross receipts tax included)

Contact information for Columbia Gas of Ohio: 200 Civic Center Dr., Columbus, OH 43215, (800) 344-4077, www.ColumbiagasofOhio.com.

PUCO-Certified Retail Natural Gas Suppliers Actively Soliciting New Customers

Supplier Name	Web Page Address	Telephone
Border Energy, Inc.	*http://www.border-energy.com/*	*(888) 479-4427*
Columbia Retail Energy	*http://www.columbiaretailenergy.com*	*(888) 493-6790*
Direct Energy Services, LLC	*http://www.directenergy.com*	*(888) 566-9988*
Dominion Energy Solutions	*http://www.dom.com/about/companies/retail/choice_eoe.jsp*	*(800) 990-4090*
Energy Cooperative of Ohio	*http://www.ohioenergycoop.org*	*(877) 439-3706*
Energy Plus Natural Gas LP	*http://www.energypluscompany.com/*	*(855) 405-3098*
Gateway Energy Services, Corp.	*http://www.gesc.com*	*(800) 313-8333*
Integrys Energy Services, Inc.	*http://www.integrysenergy.com*	*(866) 336-5547*
MxEnergy, Inc.	*http://www.mxenergy.com*	*(888) 898-4323*
Ohio Natural Gas	*http://www.onlyong.com*	*(888) 466-4427*
Spark Energy Gas, LP	*www.sparkenergy.com*	*800-982-1468*
Vectren Source	*http://www.vectrensource.com*	*888-440-9582*
Volunteer Energy Services, Inc.	*http://www.volunteerenergy.com*	*(800) 977-8374*

Supplier Plans, Rates, Terms and Descriptions

Listed below are the natural gas plan offers of PUCO-certified suppliers, per Ccf. Published offers are subject to change without prior notice. The ***Supplier Total Rate,*** which is the price to compare, includes the ***Supplier Base Rate*** and CGO's current transportation charge. If comparing Supplier Total Rate to CGO's total SSO rate, which is currently set at ***$0.59196/Ccf,*** keep in mind that the Supplier Base Rate is exclusive of applicable state and county sales tax, whereas CGO's total SSO rate is tax inclusive. As CGO's transportation rate historically changes quarterly, the Supplier Total Rate is subject to change post publication; therefore, this information should be used only as a guide. Consumers should verify offers with the supplier before signing a contract. ***The PUCO is not responsible for selections you make based on the information contained herein.***

Fixed Rate Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Border Energy, Inc.	15692	$0.72900	$0.75175	10-Month	.729 per ccf fixed Nov 2011 to Apr 2012; variable thereafter	$75.00
Columbia Retail Energy	15705	$0.69900	$0.72175	Through 12/2012 Billing Cycle		$0.00
Dominion Energy Solutions	15667	$0.65900	$0.68175	Through 10/2012 Billing Cycle		$50.00
Direct Energy Services, LLC	15671	$0.64900	$0.67175	Through 5/2012 Billing Cycle		$0.00
Gateway Energy Services, Corp.	15678	$0.69900	$0.72175	Through 11/2012 Billing Cycle	Special Introductory $50 Prepaid Card. Use promo code OH50V.	$12.50
Integrys Energy Services, Inc.	15731	$0.69400	$0.71675	12-Month	This Fixed Rate includes the Price Match Guarantee	$75.00
MxEnergy, Inc.	15684	$0.73000	$0.75275	6-Month		$150.00
	15683	$0.69900	$0.72175	12-Month		$150.00
Ohio Natural Gas	15722	$0.65900	$0.68175	6-Month		$100.00
	15721	$0.59900	$0.62175	5-Month	Winter Special! Fixed Rate good through March 31, 2012	$100.00
	15720	$0.61900	$0.64175	12-Month	Special promotional offer! Mention promo code APPLE.	$100.00
Spark Energy Gas, LP	15681	$0.68900	$0.71175	12-Month	$0.689 per Ccf	$100.00
Vectren Source	15723	$0.65500	$0.67775	12-Month		$100.00
Volunteer Energy Services, Inc.	15728	$0.64900	$0.67175	Monthly		$0.00

Monthly Variable Rate Plans

Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee

Monthly Variable Rate Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Energy Cooperative of Ohio	15693	$0.60900 Rate capped @ $0.6790	$0.63175	Monthly	Capped Rate through March 2012	$0.00
Energy Plus Natural Gas LP	15695	$0.53400	$0.55675	Monthly		$0.00
Integrys Energy Services, Inc.	15732	$0.62000	$0.64275	Monthly	Billing Month is December 2011	$0.00
MxEnergy, Inc.	15685	$0.69900	$0.72175	Monthly		$0.00
Ohio Natural Gas	15719	$0.49900	$0.52175	Monthly	Variable Plan with a discounted rate for the first 2 months	$0.00
	15718	$0.69900	$0.72175	Monthly		$0.00

Monthly Variable Capped-Rate Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Columbia Retail Energy	15706	$0.61900 Rate capped @ $0.7990	$0.64175	Through 6/2012 Billing Cycle	Monthly variable rate with 79.9 cent cap through 6/12	$0.00

Quarterly Variable Rate Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Integrys Energy Services, Inc.	15734	$0.67000	$0.69275	Monthly	EcoVations Renewable Gas w/ Carbon Offsets AT NO EXTRA	$0.00

Variable Rate w/Stable Pricing Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Integrys Energy Services, Inc.	15733	$0.54330	$0.56605	Through 11/2012 Billing Cycle	NYMEX plus .188 per Ccf with .55 Target	$75.00

Chart Definitions

Ccf: One hundred cubic feet; a unit used to measure natural gas usage.

Contract Term: The length or duration of the contract (i.e. monthly, yearly, multiple-year).

County Sales Tax: When natural gas is purchased from a supplier, the natural gas is subject to Ohio sales or use tax. Because county sales tax rates vary throughout Ohio, the county sales tax is not included in the supplier's total rate. Use the attached map to determine your county's sales tax rate.

Current Offer: Comprised of suppliers' current commodity options and base rates, exclusive of sales tax, the local utility transportation charge, and customer service charges. Commodity options may be a fixed, variable, or stable rate plan.

Fixed Rate Plan: A constant rate for the contracted period.

Gross Receipts Tax: When natural gas is purchased from a local utility, it is not subject to Ohio sales or use tax. The local utility must pay a gross receipts excise tax which is applied to the combined Monthly Customer and Riser Surcharge Charges and on the GCR and Transportation rates charged

Questions to ask Suppliers

- Are there any deposit requirements?
- Do you charge any early termination fees? If so, how much?
- Do you charge any switching, membership, or other fees?
- Are you certified by the PUCO?
- Is your rate fixed, or does it change?
- If it is a variable rate, how does it change?
- Is there a customer incentive for signing up?
- Are there any built-in price increases or decreases?
- Are there any special add-on services?
- How long is the contract for this offer?
- Does your service cover all months of the year?
- What happens when my contract expires?
- Will I receive one or two bills a month?

Standard Service Offer (SSO): A monthly variable rate and represents cost associated with the securing gas for CGO customers. The rate is based on the New York Mercantile Exchange month-end settlement price, plus a Retail Price Adjustment of $0.188 per ccf.

Stable Rate Plan: A variable rate for a fixed period of time.

Supplier Name: PUCO-certified suppliers that are actively enrolling new customers.

Supplier Total Rate: Comprised of the supplier's natural gas commodity prices, plus the LDC transportation rate charge.

Transportation Rate Charge: The transportation rate charge, which can fluctuate quarterly, is comprised of a base rate, Percentage of Income Payment Plan rider, excise tax rider, uncollectible expense rider, Choice program sharing credit and a gross receipts tax.

Variable Rate Plan: A fluctuating rate within the contracted period.

Self-Calculation Worksheet

This self-calculation worksheet will provide you with an estimate of your monthly natural gas costs, based on your average monthly gas usage, current supplier price, transportation and service charges, and local sales tax. You may also wish to visit ***www.PUCO.ohio.gov*** to access our interactive *Apples to Apples* calculator to automatically calculate your estimated monthly natural gas costs.

	Example	Your Calculation
Step 1: Supplier Offer Insert the supplier's current offer.	**Supplier Offer: $0.54196/Ccf**	**Supplier Offer: $_____/Ccf**
Step 2: Figure your Average Monthly Usage Divide your annual gas usage in Ccf *(provided on your monthly bill)* by 12.	(annual gas usage) **804 Ccf** ÷ 12 **Average Monthly Usage: 67 Ccf**	(annual gas usage) _____/Ccf ÷ 12 **Average Monthly Usage:** _____Ccf
Step 3: Supplier Charge Multiply the supplier offer by your monthly gas usage.	(supplier offer) **$0.54196** (average monthly usage) x 67 **Supplier Charge: $ 36.31**	(supplier offer) $ _____ (average monthly usage) x_____ **Supplier Charge:** $ _____
Step 4: Tax on Supplier Charge Multiply the supplier charge by your ***county sales tax rate*** that can be ascertained online through the Ohio Department of Taxation.	(supplier charge) **$ 36.31** (county sales tax rate) x 0.07 **Tax on Supplier Charge: $ 2.54**	(supplier charge) $ _____ (county sales tax rate) x 0._____ **Tax on Supplier Charge:** $ _____
Step 5: Transportation (Delivery) Charge Multiply the delivery rate by your average monthly usage *(includes gross receipts tax)*.	(delivery rate) **$0.02275** (average monthly usage) x 67 **Delivery Charge: $ 1.52**	(delivery rate) **$0.02275** (average monthly usage) x_____ **Delivery Charge: $**_____
Step 6: Supplier Estimated Monthly Cost Add the supplier charge, the tax on supplier charge, the delivery charge, and a monthly customer charge of $21.46 *(includes riser surcharge and gross receipts tax)*.	(supplier charge) **$ 36.31** (sales tax on supplier charge) 2.54 (delivery charge) 1.52 (monthly customer charge) + 21.46 **Supplier Estimated Monthly Cost: $ 61.84**	(supplier charge) $_____ (sales tax on supplier charge) _____ (delivery charge) _____ (monthly customer charge) + 21.46 **Supplier Estimated Monthly Cost: $**_____
Step 7: Columbia Gas of Ohio (CGO) Estimated Monthly Cost Multiply CGO's current total rate *(includes gas and delivery charges, plus gross receipts tax)* by your average monthly usage, then add the monthly customer charge.	(CGO's current total rate) **$0.59196** (average monthly usage) x 67 (subtotal) 39.66 (monthly customer charge) + 21.46 **CGO Estimated Monthly Cost: $ 61.12**	(CGO's current total rate) **$0.59196** (average monthly usage) x_____ (subtotal) _____ (monthly customer charge) + 21.46 **CGO Estimated Monthly Cost: $**_____
Step 8: Compare Compare the supplier's estimated monthly cost to that of Columbia Gas of Ohio.	**Supplier: $61.84/month** **Columbia Gas of Ohio: $61.12/month**	**Supplier: $**_____**/month** **Columbia Gas of Ohio: $**_____**/month**