



PUCO Apples to Apples Natural Gas Rate Comparison Chart Columbia Gas of Ohio

Publication Date: April 17, 2012

The PUCO produces the *Apples to Apples* charts to provide consumers with a snapshot comparison of current natural gas supplier price options and contract terms for individual customers. You may also want to check with your local government to see if your community has grouped together citizens into a buying pool to purchase gas. The PUCO updates the charts on a weekly basis and verifies each supplier offer to ensure accuracy. As with all contracts, consumers should carefully read and understand all terms and conditions before signing any forms or agreeing to enroll with a supplier for natural gas service. For a description of *Apples to Apples* chart-related terms, please refer to **Chart Definitions** that follows the **Supplier Plans, Rates, Terms and Conditions** section.

The PUCO provides the tools you need to calculate your estimated cost. The **Self-Calculation Worksheet** that follows **Chart Definitions** walks you through the steps needed to manually calculate your own estimated cost. You can also visit www.puco.ohio.gov and click on the **Apples to Apples** link to access the **Apples to Apples Interactive Calculator** and automatically calculate your estimated costs.

Columbia Gas of Ohio's Rate

The Standard Choice Offer (SCO) rate is based on the New York Mercantile Exchange month-end settlement price, plus a Retail Price Adjustment of \$0.153 per ccf. The SCO is a monthly variable rate and represents cost associated with the securing gas for CGO customers.

Columbia Gas of Ohio's (CGO) current total rate is **\$0.44592** per hundred cubic feet (ccf)

Effective from **March 29, 2012** to **April 29, 2012**

This total rate includes:

The Standard Choice Offer (SCO) of	\$0.37210 per ccf
A Sales Tax amount of	\$0.02512 per ccf, @6.75%
Transportation costs of	\$0.04870 per ccf (gross receipts tax included)

Contact information for Columbia Gas of Ohio: 200 Civic Center Dr., Columbus, OH 43215, (800) 344-4077, www.ColumbiagasofOhio.com.

PUCO-Certified Retail Natural Gas Suppliers Actively Soliciting New Customers

<u>Supplier Name</u>	<u>Web Page Address</u>	<u>Telephone</u>
<i>Border Energy, Inc.</i>	http://www.border-energy.com/	<i>(888) 479-4427</i>
<i>Columbia Retail Energy</i>	http://www.columbiaretailenergy.com	<i>(888) 493-6790</i>
<i>Direct Energy Services, LLC</i>	http://www.directenergy.com	<i>(888) 566-9988</i>
<i>Dominion Energy Solutions</i>	http://www.dom.com/about/companies/retail/choice_eoe.jsp	<i>(800) 990-4090</i>
<i>Energy Cooperative of Ohio</i>	http://www.ohioenergycoop.org	<i>(877) 439-3706</i>
<i>Energy Plus Natural Gas LP</i>	http://www.energypluscompany.com/	<i>(855) 405-3098</i>
<i>Integrus Energy Services, Inc.</i>	http://www.integrusenergy.com	<i>(866) 336-5547</i>
<i>MxEnergy, Inc.</i>	http://www.mxenergy.com	<i>(888) 898-4323</i>
<i>Ohio Natural Gas</i>	http://www.onlyong.com	<i>(888) 466-4427</i>
<i>Santanna Energy Services</i>	http://www.santannaenergyservices.com	<i>(800) 827-0067</i>
<i>Spark Energy Gas, LP</i>	http://www.sparkenergy.com	<i>(800) 982-1468</i>
<i>Vectren Source</i>	http://www.vectrensource.com	<i>(888) 440-9582</i>
<i>Volunteer Energy Services, Inc.</i>	http://www.volunteerenergy.com	<i>(800) 977-8374</i>

Supplier Plans, Rates, Terms and Descriptions

Listed below are the natural gas plan offers of PUCO-certified suppliers, per Ccf. Published offers are subject to change without prior notice. The **Supplier Total Rate**, which is the price to compare, includes the **Supplier Base Rate** and CGO's current transportation charge. If comparing Supplier Total Rate to CGO's total SCO rate, which is currently set at **\$0.44592/Ccf**, keep in mind that the Supplier Base Rate is exclusive of applicable state and county sales tax, whereas CGO's total SCO rate includes applicable sales tax at an average rate of 6.75%. As CGO's transportation rate historically changes quarterly, the Supplier Total Rate is subject to change post publication; therefore, this information should be used only as a guide. Consumers should verify offers with the supplier before signing a contract. **The PUCO is not responsible for selections you make based on the information contained herein.**

Fixed Rate Plans

	<u>Plan ID</u>	<u>Supplier Base Rate</u>	<u>Supplier Total Rate</u>	<u>Contract Term</u>	<u>Plan Description</u>	<u>Contract Early Termination Fee</u>
Border Energy, Inc.	17554	\$0.57900	\$0.62770	14-Month	.579 per ccf fixed May 2012 to Jun 2013; variable thereafter	\$75.00
Columbia Retail Energy	17592	\$0.54900	\$0.59770	Through 6/2013 Billing Cycle		\$0.00
Dominion Energy Solutions	17542	\$0.56900	\$0.61770	Through 3/2013 Billing Cycle		\$50.00
Direct Energy Services, LLC	17575	\$0.58900	\$0.63770	6-Month		\$0.00
Integrus Energy Services, Inc.	17617	\$0.56900	\$0.61770	12-Month	This Fixed Rate includes the Price Match Guarantee	\$75.00
	17616	\$0.59800	\$0.64670	24-Month	Term is June 2012 - May 2014	\$75.00
	17615	\$0.61900	\$0.66770	36-Month	Term is June 2012 - May 2015	\$75.00
MxEnergy, Inc.	17559	\$0.68900	\$0.73770	6-Month		\$150.00
Ohio Natural Gas	17556	\$0.55900	\$0.60770	12-Month		\$150.00
	17555	\$0.49900	\$0.54770	6-Month		\$75.00
Spark Energy Gas, LP	17609	\$0.61900	\$0.66770	12-Month	\$0.619 per Ccf	\$100.00
Santanna Energy Services	17541	\$0.58900	\$0.63770	12-Month	After 12 month term, renews monthly on market price plan.	\$0.00
Vectren Source	17603	\$0.59800	\$0.64670	12-Month		\$100.00

Monthly Variable Rate Plans

	<u>Plan ID</u>	<u>Supplier Base Rate</u>	<u>Supplier Total Rate</u>	<u>Contract Term</u>	<u>Plan Description</u>	<u>Contract Early Termination Fee</u>
Energy Cooperative of Ohio	17581	\$0.50900	\$0.55770	Monthly		\$0.00

Monthly Variable Rate Plans

	<u>Plan ID</u>	<u>Supplier Base Rate</u>	<u>Supplier Total Rate</u>	<u>Contract Term</u>	<u>Plan Description</u>	<u>Contract Early Termination Fee</u>
Integrus Energy Services, Inc.	17618	\$0.47700	\$0.52570	Monthly	Billing Month is April 2012	\$0.00
MxEnergy, Inc.	17560	\$0.49900	\$0.54770	Monthly		\$0.00
Ohio Natural Gas	17558	\$0.53900	\$0.58770	Monthly		\$0.00
	17557	\$0.39900	\$0.44770	Monthly	Variable Plan with a discounted rate for the first 2 months	\$0.00
Volunteer Energy Services, Inc.	17614	\$0.36710	\$0.41580	Monthly		\$0.00

Monthly Variable Capped-Rate Plans

	<u>Plan ID</u>	<u>Supplier Base Rate</u>	<u>Supplier Total Rate</u>	<u>Contract Term</u>	<u>Plan Description</u>	<u>Contract Early Termination Fee</u>
Columbia Retail Energy	17593	\$0.49800 Rate capped @ \$0.6490	\$0.54670	Through 6/2013 Billing Cycle	Monthly variable rate with 64.9 cent cap through 06/13	\$0.00

Quarterly Variable Rate Plans

	<u>Plan ID</u>	<u>Supplier Base Rate</u>	<u>Supplier Total Rate</u>	<u>Contract Term</u>	<u>Plan Description</u>	<u>Contract Early Termination Fee</u>
Integrus Energy Services, Inc.	17619	\$0.49000	\$0.53870	Monthly	EcoVations Renewable Gas w/ Carbon Offsets AT NO EXTRA	\$75.00

Variable Rate Plans

	<u>Plan ID</u>	<u>Supplier Base Rate</u>	<u>Supplier Total Rate</u>	<u>Contract Term</u>	<u>Plan Description</u>	<u>Contract Early Termination Fee</u>
Energy Plus Natural Gas LP	17596	\$0.35520	\$0.40390	Monthly		\$0.00

Variable Rate w/Stable Pricing Plans

	<u>Plan ID</u>	<u>Supplier Base Rate</u>	<u>Supplier Total Rate</u>	<u>Contract Term</u>	<u>Plan Description</u>	<u>Contract Early Termination Fee</u>
Energy Cooperative of Ohio	17580	\$0.47500	\$0.52370	Monthly	Stable price through Aug 2012, variable starting Sept 2012	\$0.00

Chart Definitions

Ccf: One hundred cubic feet; a unit used to measure natural gas usage.

Contract Term: The length or duration of the contract (i.e. monthly, yearly, multiple-year).

County Sales Tax: When natural gas is purchased from a supplier, the natural gas is subject to Ohio sales or use tax. Because county sales tax rates vary throughout Ohio, the county sales tax is not included in the supplier's total rate. Use the attached map to determine your county's sales tax rate.

Current Offer: Comprised of suppliers' current commodity options and base rates, exclusive of sales tax, the local utility transportation charge, and customer service charges. Commodity options may be a fixed, variable, or stable rate plan.

Fixed Rate Plan: A constant rate for the contracted period.

Gross Receipts Tax: When natural gas is purchased from a local utility, it is not subject to Ohio sales or use tax. The local utility must pay a gross receipts excise tax which is applied to the combined Monthly Customer and Transportation rates charged on the volume of gas consumed (per Ccf).

Standard Choice Offer (SCO): A monthly variable rate and represents cost associated with the securing gas for CGO customers. The rate is based on the New York Mercantile Exchange month-end settlement price, plus a Retail Price Adjustment of \$0.153 per ccf.

Stable Rate Plan: A variable rate for a fixed period of time.

Supplier Name: PUCO-certified suppliers that are actively enrolling new customers.

Supplier Total Rate: Comprised of the supplier's natural gas commodity prices, plus the LDC transportation rate charge.

Transportation Rate Charge: The transportation rate charge, which can fluctuate quarterly, is comprised of a base rate, Percentage of Income Payment Plan rider, excise tax rider, uncollectible expense rider, Choice program sharing credit and a gross receipts tax.

Variable Rate Plan: A fluctuating rate within the contracted period.

Questions to ask Suppliers

- Are there any deposit requirements?
- Do you charge any early termination fees? If so, how much?
- Do you charge any switching, membership, or other fees?
- Are you certified by the PUCO?
- Is your rate fixed, or does it change?
- If it is a variable rate, how does it change?
- Is there a customer incentive for signing up?
- Are there any built-in price increases or decreases?
- Are there any special add-on services?
- How long is the contract for this offer?
- Does your service cover all months of the year?
- What happens when my contract expires?
- Will I receive one or two bills a month?

Self-Calculation Worksheet

This self-calculation worksheet will provide you with an estimate of your monthly natural gas costs, based on your average monthly gas usage, current supplier price, transportation and service charges, and local sales tax. You may also wish to visit www.PUCO.ohio.gov to access our interactive *Apples to Apples* calculator to automatically calculate your estimated monthly natural gas costs.

	Example	Your Calculation
Step 1: Supplier Offer Insert the supplier's current offer.	Supplier Offer: \$0.39592/Ccf	Supplier Offer: \$ _____/Ccf
Step 2: Figure your Average Monthly Usage Divide your annual gas usage in Ccf (<i>provided on your monthly bill</i>) by 12.	(annual gas usage) 804 Ccf ÷ <u>12</u> Average Monthly Usage: 67 Ccf	(annual gas usage) _____/Ccf ÷ <u>12</u> Average Monthly Usage: _____ Ccf
Step 3: Supplier Charge Multiply the supplier offer by your monthly gas usage.	(supplier offer) \$0.39592 (average monthly usage) <u>x 67</u> Supplier Charge: \$ 26.53	(supplier offer) \$ _____ (average monthly usage) x _____ Supplier Charge: \$ _____
Step 4: Tax on Supplier Charge Multiply the supplier charge by your county sales tax rate that can be ascertained online through the Ohio Department of Taxation.	(supplier charge) \$ 26.53 (county sales tax rate) <u>x 0.07</u> Tax on Supplier Charge: \$ 1.72	(supplier charge) \$ _____ (county sales tax rate) x 0. _____ Tax on Supplier Charge: \$ _____
Step 5: Transportation (Delivery) Charge Multiply the delivery rate by your average monthly usage (<i>includes gross receipts tax</i>).	(delivery rate) \$0.04870 (average monthly usage) <u>x 67</u> Delivery Charge: \$ 3.26	(delivery rate) \$0.04870 (average monthly usage) x _____ Delivery Charge: \$ _____
Step 6: Supplier Estimated Monthly Cost Add the supplier charge, the tax on supplier charge, the delivery charge, and a monthly customer charge of \$21.46 (<i>includes riser surcharge and gross receipts tax</i>).	(supplier charge) \$ 26.53 (sales tax on supplier charge) 1.72 (delivery charge) 3.26 (monthly customer charge) + <u>21.46</u> Supplier Estimated Monthly Cost: \$ 53.11	(supplier charge) \$ _____ (sales tax on supplier charge) _____ (delivery charge) _____ (monthly customer charge) + <u>21.46</u> Supplier Estimated Monthly Cost: \$ _____
Step 7: Columbia Gas of Ohio (CGO) Estimated Monthly Cost Multiply CGO's current total rate (<i>includes gas charges with an applicable average sales tax of 6.75%, and delivery charges including a gross receipts tax</i>) by your average monthly usage, then add the monthly customer charge.	(CGO's current total rate) \$0.44592 (average monthly usage) <u>x 67</u> (subtotal) 29.88 (monthly customer charge) + <u>21.46</u> CGO Estimated Monthly Cost: \$ 51.34	(CGO's current total rate) \$0.44592 (average monthly usage) x _____ (subtotal) _____ (monthly customer charge) + <u>21.46</u> CGO Estimated Monthly Cost: \$ _____
Step 8: Compare Compare the supplier's estimated monthly cost as of Ohio.	Supplier: \$53.11/month Columbia Gas of Ohio: \$51.34/month <small>The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio</small>	Supplier: \$ _____/month Columbia Gas of Ohio: \$ _____/month



The Public Utilities
Commission of Ohio

180 E. Broad Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793 • An Equal Opportunity Employer and Service Provider