PUCO Apples to Apples Natural Gas Rate Comparison Chart
Columbia Gas of Ohio

Publication Date: May 22, 2012

The PUCO produces the *Apples to Apples* charts to provide consumers with a snapshot comparison of current natural gas supplier price options and contract terms for individual customers. You may also want to check with your local government to see if your community has grouped together citizens into a buying pool to purchase gas. The PUCO updates the charts on a weekly basis and verifies each supplier offer to ensure accuracy. As with all contracts, consumers should carefully read and understand all terms and conditions before signing any forms or agreeing to enroll with a supplier for natural gas service. For a description of *Apples to Apples* chart-related terms, please refer to ***Chart Definitions*** that follows the ***Supplier Plans, Rates, Terms and Conditions*** section.

The PUCO provides the tools you need to calculate your estimated cost. The ***Self-Calculation Worksheet*** that follows ***Chart Definitions*** walks you through the steps needed to manually calculate your own estimated cost. You can also visit ***www.puco.ohio.gov*** and click on the ***Apples to Apples*** link to access the ***Apples to Apples Interactive Calculator*** and automatically calculate your estimated costs.

Columbia Gas of Ohio's Rate

The Standard Choice Offer (SCO) rate is based on the New York Mercantile Exchange month-end settlement price, plus a Retail Price Adjustment of $0.153 per ccf. The SCO is a monthly variable rate and represents cost associated with the securing gas for CGO customers.

Columbia Gas of Ohio's (CGO) current total rate is **$0.43619** per hundred cubic feet (ccf)

Effective from **April 30, 2012** to **May 29, 2012**

This total rate includes:

The Standard Choice Offer (SCO) of	**$0.35660** per ccf
A Sales Tax amount of	**$0.02407** per ccf, @6.75%
Transportation costs of	**$0.05552** per ccf (gross receipts tax included)

Contact information for Columbia Gas of Ohio: 200 Civic Center Dr., Columbus, OH 43215, (800) 344-4077, www.ColumbiagasofOhio.com.

PUCO-Certified Retail Natural Gas Suppliers Actively Soliciting New Customers

Supplier Name	Web Page Address	Telephone
Border Energy, Inc.	*http://www.border-energy.com/*	*(888) 479-4427*
Columbia Retail Energy	*http://www.columbiaretailenergy.com*	*(888) 493-6790*
Direct Energy Services, LLC	*http://www.directenergy.com*	*(888) 566-9988*
Dominion Energy Solutions	*http://www.dom.com/about/companies/retail/choice_eoe.jsp*	*(800) 990-4090*
Energy Cooperative of Ohio	*http://www.ohioenergycoop.org*	*(877) 439-3706*
Energy Plus Natural Gas LP	*http://www.energypluscompany.com/*	*(855) 405-3098*
Integrys Energy Services, Inc.	*http://www.integrysenergy.com*	*(866) 336-5547*
Just Energy	*http://www.justenergy.com/*	*(877) 226-5371*
MxEnergy, Inc.	*http://www.mxenergy.com*	*(888) 898-4323*
Ohio Natural Gas	*http://www.onlyong.com*	*(888) 466-4427*
Santanna Energy Services	*http://www.santannaenergyservices.com*	*(800) 827-0067*
Spark Energy Gas, LP	*http://www.sparkenergy.com*	*(800) 982-1468*
XOOM Energy Ohio, LLC	*http://www.xoomenergy.com*	*(888) 997-8979*

Supplier Plans, Rates, Terms and Descriptions

Listed below are the natural gas plan offers of PUCO-certified suppliers, per Ccf. Published offers are subject to change without prior notice. The ***Supplier Total Rate,*** which is the price to compare, includes the ***Supplier Base Rate*** and CGO's current transportation charge. If comparing Supplier Total Rate to CGO's total SCO rate, which is currently set at ***$0.43619/Ccf,*** keep in mind that the Supplier Base Rate is exclusive of applicable state and county sales tax, whereas CGO's total SCO rate includes applicable sales tax at an average rate of 6.75%. As CGO's transportation rate historically changes quarterly, the Supplier Total Rate is subject to change post publication; therefore, this information should be used only as a guide. Consumers should verify offers with the supplier before signing a contract. ***The PUCO is not responsible for selections you make based on the information contained herein.***

Fixed Rate Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Border Energy, Inc.	18030	$0.57900	$0.63452	12-Month	.579 per ccf fixed May 2012 to Jun 2013; variable thereafter	$75.00
Just Energy	18084	$0.69900	$0.75452	12-Month		$50.00
Columbia Retail Energy	18082	$0.54900	$0.60452	Through 6/2013 Billing Cycle		$0.00
Dominion Energy Solutions	18023	$0.51900	$0.57452	Through 6/2013 Billing Cycle		$50.00
Direct Energy Services, LLC	18053	$0.49900	$0.55452	6-Month		$0.00
Integrys Energy Services, Inc.	18094	$0.56900	$0.62452	24-Month	Term is July 2012 - June 2014	$75.00
	18092	$0.59800	$0.65352	36-Month	Term is July 2012 - June 2015	$75.00
	18089	$0.54900	$0.60452	12-Month	This Fixed Rate includes the Price Match Guarantee	$75.00
MxEnergy, Inc.	18041	$0.59900	$0.65452	12-Month		$150.00
Ohio Natural Gas	18039	$0.53900	$0.59452	12-Month	Special promotional offer! Mention promo code APPLE.	$150.00
	18038	$0.49900	$0.55452	6-Month	Special promotional offer! Mention promo code APPLE.	$75.00
Spark Energy Gas, LP	18072	$0.61900	$0.67452	12-Month	$0.619 per Ccf	$100.00
Santanna Energy Services	18048	$0.58900	$0.64452	12-Month	After 12 month term, renews monthly on market price plan.	$0.00
XOOM Energy Ohio, LLC	18066	$0.55900	$0.61452	12-Month	XOOM Energy's SureLock 12 fixed plan	$110.00

Monthly Variable Rate Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee

Monthly Variable Rate Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Energy Cooperative of Ohio	18058	$0.46090	$0.51642	Monthly		$0.00
Integrys Energy Services, Inc.	18093	$0.48900	$0.54452	Monthly	Billing Month is June 2012	$0.00
MxEnergy, Inc.	18042	$0.49900	$0.55452	Monthly		$0.00
Ohio Natural Gas	18040	$0.49900	$0.55452	Monthly		$0.00
XOOM Energy Ohio, LLC	18067	$0.36530	$0.42082	Monthly	XOOM Energy's SimpleFlex monthly variable plan	$0.00

Monthly Variable Capped-Rate Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Columbia Retail Energy	18083	$0.49800 *Rate capped @ $0.6490*	$0.55352	Through 6/2013 Billing Cycle	Monthly variable rate with 64.9 cent cap through 06/13	$0.00

Variable Rate Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Just Energy	18085	$0.34770	$0.40322	60-Month	Bill Month 5/2012. Up to 5% below Utility for 1st 3 months.	$50.00
Energy Plus Natural Gas LP	18070	$0.33750	$0.39302	Monthly	Forecasted rate for your 1st month of service	$0.00
	18015	$0.33750	$0.39302	Monthly	Forecasted rate for your 1st month of service	$0.00

Variable Rate w/Stable Pricing Plans

	Plan ID	Supplier Base Rate	Supplier Total Rate	Contract Term	Plan Description	Contract Early Termination Fee
Energy Cooperative of Ohio	18057	$0.47500	$0.53052	Monthly	Stable price through Aug 2012, variable starting Sept 2012	$0.00

Chart Definitions

Ccf: One hundred cubic feet; a unit used to measure natural gas usage.

Contract Term: The length or duration of the contract (i.e. monthly, yearly, multiple-year).

County Sales Tax: When natural gas is purchased from another supplier or as part of Columbia's Standard Choice Offer (SCO) program, the natural gas is subject to Ohio sales or use tax. Because county sales tax rates vary throughout Ohio, the county sales tax is not included in the alternate supplier's total rate. For Columbia SCO customers, sales tax at an average of 6.75% is included in the current total SCO rate. Use the attached map to determine your county's actual sales tax rate.

Current Offer: Comprised of suppliers' current commodity options and base rates, exclusive of sales tax, the local utility transportation charge, and customer service charges. Commodity options may be a fixed, variable, or stable rate plan.

Fixed Rate Plan: A constant rate for the contracted period.

Gross Receipts Tax: The local utility must pay a gross receipts excise tax of 4.987% which is applied to the combined Monthly Customer Charge and the Transportation rates charged on the volume of gas consumed (per Ccf).

Questions to ask Suppliers

- Are there any deposit requirements?
- Do you charge any early termination fees? If so, how much?
- Do you charge any switching, membership, or other fees?
- Are you certified by the PUCO?
- Is your rate fixed, or does it change?
- If it is a variable rate, how does it change?
- Is there a customer incentive for signing up?
- Are there any built-in price increases or decreases?
- Are there any special add-on services?
- How long is the contract for this offer?
- Does your service cover all months of the year?
- What happens when my contract expires?
- Will I receive one or two bills a month?

Standard Choice Offer (SCO): A monthly variable rate and represents cost associated with the securing gas for CGO customers. The rate is based on the New York Mercantile Exchange month-end settlement price, plus a Retail Price Adjustment of $0.153 per ccf. The Retail Price Adjustment of $0.153 per ccf will be in effect from April 1, 2012 through March 31, 2013.

Supplier Name: PUCO-certified suppliers that are actively enrolling new customers.

Supplier Total Rate: Comprised of the supplier's natural gas commodity prices, plus the LDC transportation rate charge.

Transportation Rate Charge: The transportation rate charge, which can fluctuate quarterly, is comprised of a base rate, PUCO approved and tariffed riders, and a Gross Receipts Tax.

Variable Rate Plan: A fluctuating rate within the contracted period.

Self-Calculation Worksheet

This self-calculation worksheet will provide you with an estimate of your monthly natural gas costs, based on your average monthly gas usage, current supplier price, transportation and service charges, and local sales tax. You may also wish to visit **www.PUCO.ohio.gov** to access our interactive *Apples to Apples* calculator to automatically calculate your estimated monthly natural gas costs.

	Example	Your Calculation
Step 1: Supplier Offer Insert the supplier's current offer.	**Supplier Offer: $0.38619/Ccf**	**Supplier Offer: $_____/Ccf**
Step 2: Figure your Average Monthly Usage Divide your annual gas usage in Ccf *(provided on your monthly bill)* by 12.	(annual gas usage) **804 Ccf** ÷ 12 **Average Monthly Usage: 67 Ccf**	(annual gas usage) _____/Ccf ÷ 12 **Average Monthly Usage:** _____Ccf
Step 3: Supplier Charge Multiply the supplier offer by your monthly gas usage.	(supplier offer) **$0.38619** (average monthly usage) x 67 **Supplier Charge: $ 25.87**	(supplier offer) $ _____ (average monthly usage) x_____ **Supplier Charge:** $ _____
Step 4: Tax on Supplier Charge Multiply the supplier charge by your ***county sales tax rate*** that can be ascertained online through the Ohio Department of Taxation.	(supplier charge) **$ 25.87** (county sales tax rate) x 0.07 **Tax on Supplier Charge: $ 1.68**	(supplier charge) $ _____ (county sales tax rate) x 0._____ **Tax on Supplier Charge:** $ _____
Step 5: Transportation (Delivery) Charge Multiply the delivery rate by your average monthly usage *(includes gross receipts tax)*.	(delivery rate) **$0.05552** (average monthly usage) x 67 **Delivery Charge: $ 3.72**	(delivery rate) **$0.05552** (average monthly usage) x_____ **Delivery Charge: $**_____
Step 6: Supplier Estimated Monthly Cost Add the supplier charge, the tax on supplier charge, the delivery charge, and a monthly customer charge of $22.45 *(includes riser surcharge and gross receipts tax)*.	(supplier charge) **$ 25.87** (sales tax on supplier charge) 1.68 (delivery charge) 3.72 (monthly customer charge) + 22.45 **Supplier Estimated Monthly Cost: $ 53.86**	(supplier charge) $_____ (sales tax on supplier charge) _____ (delivery charge) _____ (monthly customer charge) + 22.45 **Supplier Estimated Monthly Cost: $**_____
Step 7: Columbia Gas of Ohio (CGO) Estimated Monthly Cost Multiply CGO's current total rate *(includes gas charges with an applicable average sales tax of 6.75%, and delivery charges including a gross reciepts tax)* by your average monthly usage, then add the monthly customer charge.	(CGO's current total rate) **$0.43619** (average monthly usage) x 67 (subtotal) 29.22 (monthly customer charge) + 22.45 **CGO Estimated Monthly Cost: $ 51.67**	(CGO's current total rate) **$0.43619** (average monthly usage) x_____ (subtotal) _____ (monthly customer charge) + 22.45 **CGO Estimated Monthly Cost: $**_____
Step 8: Compare Compare the supplier's estimated monthly cost as of Ohio.	**Supplier: $53.86/month** **Columbia Gas of Ohio: $51.67/month**	**Supplier: $_____/month** **Columbia Gas of Ohio: $_____/month**